

Bursars' Committee

**MINUTES of the meeting held at 2.15 pm on Thursday, 16 November 2023
in the Audit Room at King's College.**

The meeting was chaired by the new Secretary Robert Gardiner (CAI) in the absence of the new Chair (Richard Anthony, JE) and the minute taker was Matthew Russell (Office of Intercollegiate Services).

Attendance: Please note that blank cells below represent Colleges that were not represented at the meeting.

Christ's	Michael Parsons
Churchill	Tamsin James
Clare	Elizabeth Conder
Clare Hall	Per Reiff-Musgrove David James
Corpus Christi	Jenny Raine Gemma Donaldson
Darwin	John Dix Giles Greenfield
Downing	Gavin Flynn Rob Beardwell
Emmanuel	
Fitzwilliam	Rod Cantrill
Girton	Jimmy Anderson Maureen Hackett
Gonville & Caius	Robert Gardiner
Homerton	Simon Brockington
Hughes Hall	Jonathan Newby
Jesus	Stuart Websdale
King's	Ivan Collister Polly Ingham
Lucy Cavendish	Tony McNiff
Magdalene	Steven Morris Helen Fford

Murray Edwards	Rob Hopwood
Newnham	Christopher Lawrence
Pembroke	Andrew Cates Catherine Rawlings
Peterhouse	Ian Wright
Queens'	Andrew Bainbridge
Robinson	Fiona Brockbank
St. Catharine's	Nicola Robert Helen Hayward
St. Edmund's	Rob Preston
St John's	
Selwyn	Jennifer Phillips
Sidney Sussex	
Trinity	Richard Turnill Emma Davies
Trinity Hall	Tim Harvey-Samuel
Wolfson	Joanna Cheffins
Senior Tutors' Ctte	Marina Frasca Spada (CC)
Colleges' Ctte	
Development Directors Ctte	

Margaret Beaufort	
Ridley Hall	
Wesley House	

Westcott House	
Westminster	Simon Shinkfield

University	
OIS	Matthew Russell, Malcolm Millbrook and Diane Brooker

Natalie Acton, Head of Student Support, and Jenny O'Hare, Programme Manager, Mental Health Change Programme attended the meeting for item BC.23.8

There were no declarations of interest.

BC.23.1 Welcome

The Committee welcomed the following to their first meeting:

- Polly Ingham, King's College (Domus Bursar)
- Tony McNiff, Lucy Cavendish College
- Tatjana Walker, Lucy Cavendish College (Operations and Estates Director) *in absentia*
- Martin Pierce, Sidney Sussex College *in absentia*

BC.23.2 Terms of Reference

The Committee received for reference the following documents relating to the operation of the committee:

Paper 1 Bursars' Committee: Terms of Reference
Paper 2 Privacy Statement

It agreed to amend the list of attendees to include other officers of the Office of Intercollegiate Services by amending:

- iv. **the Head of the Office of Intercollegiate Services (OIS) and other relevant officers or administrative staff of OIS**

BC.23.3 Minutes of the meeting held on 13 July 2023

The minutes of the meeting on 13 July 2023 were approved as a true record.

BC.23.4 Matters arising not elsewhere on the agenda

There were no matters arising not raised elsewhere on the agenda.

PRINCIPAL AND SUBSTANTIVE BUSINESS

BC.23.5 Review of the Colleges Fund

The Committee received draft terms of reference for the Working Group set up by the Committee for a review of the Colleges' Fund:

Paper 3 Terms of reference

It noted that a number of members had submitted comments on the terms of reference to the Chair before the meeting: further suggestions were made at the meeting, which included:

- The "scope" of the Working Group should be amended to be "terms of reference".
- Defined parameter I should be amended to make it clear that the Working Group should make recommendations about the purposes of the Colleges' Fund to the Bursars' Committee, for it to consider in full before any wider recommendations were taken forward to the Colleges Fund Committee or elsewhere.
- Defined parameter III should articulate more clearly what is intended by the phrases "broader systemic issues" and "specific intercollegiate issues particularly around student financial support".
- A fourth defined parameter (IV) should be introduced to make it clear that the Working Group will consult widely and frequently with Bursars of all Colleges.

- In point (d), the Working Group should extend its consideration of the use of grants to be “wholly” (and not just “partially”) available for other purposes.
- The Working Group should commit to their reporting of progress, and not just endeavour to do so.

The Committee agreed that the Working Group would provide a revised set of terms of reference at the next meeting for consideration.

Otherwise, the Committee noted that the Working Group was still in its information gathering phase: one early conclusion, however, was that the operations relating to the Colleges Fund (including (a) the determination of College taxation by the Assessment Committee and (b) the use of the additional metrics requested by the Colleges’ Fund Committee in 2016) were not widely known by Bursars. To that end, additional information was provided for the meeting for reference:

Paper 4 2023 Metrics provided by OIS to the Colleges’ Fund

Paper 23 Report from the Bursarial members of the Assessment Committee

It was noted that the parameters used by the Assessment Committee were set out in University Statutes: in anticipation of possible future changes, the University had commenced a process to move the Statutes into Ordinances (in order for the University to control better its own regulation of the Fund and to facilitate rapid amendments to those regulations).

It was clarified that the metrics provided annually had not yet been used by the Colleges’ Fund Committee for the purposes of grant size allocation, but that this may change going forward. **The Committee urged the Colleges’ Fund Committee to be transparent in its use of the metrics and other information it used to determine grant allocations.**

BC.23.6 Teaching Review

The Committee noted the establishment of a joint University and Colleges Teaching Review and the membership of its Working Group, following its consideration by the Colleges’ Committee on 28 October 2023:

Paper 5 Review of Student Teaching terms of reference

It noted that the six College representatives on the Teaching Review Task and Finish Group included Judith Bunbury (W), Paul Dominiak (JE), Christopher Lawrence (N), Malcolm Millbrook (OIS), Rita Monson (CHU) and Pippa Rogerson (CAI).

Malcolm Millbrook clarified that, at the moment, it was intended that the Task and Finish Group would meet termly, but would be supported by (a) an Advisory Group, whose membership would change and evolve over time depending on the active items on a programme of work and (b) an Operations Group, which would meet frequently to take forward the agreed programme of work, which was still in development. Malcolm Millbrook would also be a member of the Operations Group.

Members of the Committee stressed the importance that the large scale of the review should not obviate the need for short-term improvements and encouraged the programme of work to include clear milestones.

BC.23.7 Principles of Collaboration (fundraising)

Further to the brief discussion at the Network meeting on 9 November 2023, the Committee received for information the minutes of the discussion at Colleges' Committee:

- Paper 6 Principles of Collaboration
 Paper 7 Minute extracts from CDDC on 25 October and the Colleges' Committee on 28 October 2023.

The Committee noted that progressing the proposals brought forward by the Colleges' Committee would be referred in the first instance to the Joint Committee on Development to broker appropriate negotiations on the further amendments between the Colleges and the University. There was general support for the view that the "principles" were an improvement on the current Code of Practice and should be adopted as soon as practicable, even if the negotiations over the shared prospect threshold needed to continue.

BC.23.8 Mental Health Change Programme

Natalie Acton, Head of Student Support, and Jenny O'Hare, Programme Manager, Mental Health Change Programme attended the meeting for this item.

The Committee received a presentation outlining the financing underpinning the Mental Health Change Programme and the current direction of the costs:

- Paper 8 Mental Health Review Financial Update (November 2023)

Natalie Acton and Jenny O'Hare spoke to their presentation slides, which covered the outcomes of the preceding review, the agreed 3-year change programme plan and the progress of working through the plan to date. They also drew attention to the agreed stepped-care model and the respective responsibilities of the Colleges and the University. In clarifying the financial elements of the change programme plan, it was clarified that the "green" columns of data represented where costs were expected to be at this stage in the plan, but adjusted for inflation since the inception of the plan, and the "blue" column represented projected current spend, as reported in the last intercollegiate survey in December 2022. Attention was drawn to the differences between the "blue" and "green" columns, particularly on mental health spend by the Colleges.

In its discussion, the Committee considered a number of reasons for the current discrepancies between actual and projected spend, including:

- the December 2022 data and its 2025-26 projections may not be correct: Bursars noted that categorisation in the next return was important and they might wish to be more diligent about its completion.
- the University spend on the change programme plan was within reasonable boundaries of predicted spend: any over-spend was a consequence of an unforeseen and substantial additional philanthropic gift.
- the change programme plan did not anticipate the rapid growth of wellbeing appointments in Colleges: the reported overspend might be a matter of the spend being brought forward over the period and/or Colleges employing higher FTEs than anticipated (either because of the perceived need, philanthropic funding and/or an initial under-estimation of the value of the roles). **The Committee agreed it would be helpful to capture the extent to which "wellbeing roles" in Colleges were also undertaking clinical activities (possibly an artefact of the type of persons recruited by individual Colleges).**

- the change programme plan anticipated a concomitant reduction in spend on clinical services (provided either through directly-employed staff or through contract services): the figures highlighted instead an increased spend in this area over the period. Suggested reasons for this included:
 - a) a potential lag in the adjustment of clinical services, noting the complexities of managing employed staff and/or agreed service contracts;
 - b) a reluctance of Colleges to engage fully with the increased clinical provision in the University within the 3-year period of the plan (which may indicate that some College governing bodies were finding it challenging to understand or determine how to move to the agreed stepped-care model);
 - c) a lack of agreement of individual Colleges with the agreed plan and/or where the real focus of risk and liability lies. On this last point, Natalie Acton pointed out that all students were members of the University as well as the College and the quality of the clinical care provision of the University was more likely to be comprehensive in meeting the needs of the more complex cases.

Members of the Committee expressed concern that this was a matter where all Colleges needed to work in concert about levels of service and expectations, particularly in the light of discussions for the 2025-26 intercollegiate levies. Each College would need to be mindful of its current and projected spend within the agreed strategy for mental health provision, and the current and projected spend outside of that agreed strategy. It was stressed that the allocation of costs of any future levies would only take into account spend within the agreed strategy.

In response to a question about the mode of engagement of students with the University Counselling Service, it was clarified that all appointments were advertised as a “single use” session with no limit on the number of times any student could access the service: this was a move away from the previous model of a guaranteed number of agreed sessions. It was reported about 60% of student users had accessed the service more than once, and the waiting times for an appointment were around 3 working days (well below the service agreement of 10 working days agreed with the Joint Wellbeing Committee) compared with 7 weeks before the implementation of the Change Programme. It was also reported that Senior Tutors receive a quarterly report about the service take-up of their students, along with comparative data across all Colleges. This data enabled the College to determine whether its use of the centralised services (as outlined in the stepped-care plan) was in line with other Colleges. Natalie Acton confirmed that her team would be keen to meet with any College to discuss its use of the services and how to improve that. **The Committee requested that the quarterly usage data be sent also to Senior and sole Bursars to improve the communication of the data.**

Finally, in response to a question about the Crane’s Fund, Bursars were notified of its recent strategy to spend down its reserves and that its grants would be more modest in future and in line with the income from its permanent capital. It noted that the extensive application of the Crane’s Fund had set up an expectation from Colleges and students that weekly and long-term therapy would be provided by Cambridge: it was stressed that other universities did not offer this level of service, and that it would be challenging to re-set such expectations.

The Committee warmly thanked Natalie Action and Jenny O’Hare for their clear and concise presentation.

BC.23.9 Levies Panel

The Chair of the Levies Panel provided an update on discussions at its meeting on 6 November 2023:

Paper 9 Levies Panel: minutes 6 November 2023

He reported:

- i) the first meeting of the year was to define the parameters and terms of engagement for the 2024-25 levies round.
- ii) the Panel had agreed that the published inflation rates for continuing levies should be 4% for staff costs and 3% for non-staff costs.
- iii) progress had been made about the University engaging in the prioritisation of its requested levies: Nick Tamkin (Secretary to the Resource Management Committee) had been asked to take the lead on this work.
- iv) the future of the e-books levy had been questioned, especially in the light of a lack of progress in the requester (the University Library) being able to resolve (a) a rationale for the overall size of the contribution from the Colleges and (b) agreement with College Librarians on an appropriate methodology for the distribution of that contribution across the Colleges. **The Committee agreed that the University Library should be asked to focus on the first of these two points.**
- v) the Colleges IT Committee had now approved the payment of invoices relating to the “Digital Admissions” levy for 2021-22, 2022-23 and 2023-24 following the (delayed) delivery of a minimum viable product (see also Paper 17). The total sums amounted to £420,000 over the three years, which had been collected and held in OIS in the three annual levy exercises.

BC.23.10 College banking facilities

In response to the risk of activists protesting about College banking facilities, the Committee received for information a copy of a briefing by Ellen Quigley, Special Adviser (Responsible Investment) to the Chief Financial Officer of the University:

Paper 10 Banking engagements with the Collegiate university

Members of the Committee reported that there had been no large-scale pressure about changing banking facilities. One College reported that their JCR had reviewed its own banking practices but had concluded that their current bank remained as appropriate as any other.

OTHER MATTERS FOR DECISION

BC.23.11 Amendments to terms of reference

a) Fees and Student Finance

The Committee approved amendments to the Sub-Committee’s terms of reference:

Paper 11 Draft terms of reference: Fees and Student Finance Sub-Committee

It was noted that (relating to purpose (d)), it was noted that the creation of appropriate figures for student cost of living was now conducted by a joint exercise of the University and the CSU. The Sub-Committee retained a role for commenting on how this is presented publicly.

BC.23.12 Membership of Sub-Committees and Other Bodies

The Committee approved the following proposals for representation on other committees:

<i>on...</i>	<i>appointment of...</i>	<i>replacing...</i>
Planning Sub-Committee	Catherine Webb (EM)	Andrew Grieve (HH)
Technical Sub-Committee of the ICCA	Lizzy Conder (CL) Nichola Morse (CC) Nichola Trapmore (SID)	Andrew Grieve (HH)
Programme Board member for "Reshaping the Estate"	Helen Hayward (CTH)	<i>New</i>
Undergraduate teaching review	Christopher Lawrence (N)	<i>New</i>
University Sports Committee	Martin Pierce (SID)	Andrew Grieve (HH)
University Sports Committee: Finances and Resources Committee	Catherine Rawlings (PEM)	Thomas Boden (CHU)

Attention was drawn to the following current vacancy:

<i>on ...</i>	<i>replacing ...</i>
e-books/Library representative	<i>New</i>

STANDING BUSINESS – MATTERS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES FOR INFORMATION OR REPORT**BC.23.13 Bursars' Business Committee**

The minutes of the Bursars' Business Committee were received for information:

Paper 12 Minutes of the meeting on 19 October 2023

Matters arising from those minutes that require discussion had been raised elsewhere in the agenda.

BC.23.14 Undergraduate Admissions Committee and Cambridge Admissions Management Group

The minutes of the Undergraduate Admissions Committee were received for information, together with an update on current progress towards providing new assessments for candidates applying in 2024:

Paper 13 Minutes of Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 2 October 2023

Paper 14 Update on Undergraduate Admissions Testing 2024-25, November 2023

Rod Cantrill (F) updated the Committee on important developments relating to the Admissions Assessment project: he reported:

- i) there had been extensive consideration of the risks of the project, the importance of which had been highlighted by the recent reports on the new admissions assessments at Oxford University.
- ii) in response to a question, he emphasised the views of the implementation group on the impact on widening participation, and the view that the new structure of the tests would be more supportive of applicants from under-privileged backgrounds (moving as it does away from extensive support from their school). The Committee was reminded that WP applicants would be entitled to a bursary voucher, in common with other public tests.

- iii) the Cambridge portion of the initial loan capital for the new joint venture company would be met entirely by the University, with an informal agreement that the Colleges would meet 50% of any outstanding liability at the end of the initial loan period. It was clarified that the loan liability for any individual College would not be material for the purposes of reporting in College accounts.

BC.23.15 Joint Wellbeing Committee

The minutes of recent meetings were received for information:

- Paper 15 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 27 July 2023
 Paper 16 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 5 October 2023

In the context of minute BC.23.8 above, attention was drawn to minute 6 of Paper 16.

BC.23.16 Minutes and Reports from Sub-Committees and Other Intercollegiate Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Meetings since last BC</i>
<i>Bursar Sub-Committees</i>	
Fees and Student Finance Sub-Committee	11 October 2023
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	12 October 2023
Legal Affairs and Employment Sub-Committee	13 October 2023
Planning Sub-Committee	12 October 2023
Sustainability Sub-Committee	26 October 2023
Taxation Sub-Committee	<i>No minutes</i>
<i>Other Intercollegiate Committees</i>	
Technical Sub-Committee of ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
Colleges' Committee	28 October 2023
College Development Directors' Committee	25 October 2023
Colleges' IT Committee	18 October 2023
Colleges' Standing Committee	10 October 2023
Senior Tutors' Committee	3 November 2023
University and Colleges Joint Committee	17 October 2023

Reports had been received from the following:

Sub-Committee	Chair	Written report for this BC
Colleges' IT Committee	Jennifer Phillips (SEL)	Paper 17
Fees and Funding Sub-Committee	Andrew Cates (PEM)	Paper 18
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	Lizzie Conder (CL)	Paper 19 (with attachments)
Legal Affairs & Employment Sub-Committee	Jo Cheffins (W)	Paper 20
Taxation Sub-Committee Gerald Eve Valuation Schedule	Lizzy Conder (CL)	Paper 21 (with attachments)

Attention was drawn specifically to:

- a) Colleges IT Committee: it was noted the figure in paragraph 1 should read “£420,000” instead of “£520,000”: **the Committee approved the authorisation of payment of the outstanding invoices.**
- b) General Purchasing Sub-Committee: Bursars were invited to provide comments on the Committee’s terms of reference and programme of work for this year to the Chair.

BC.23.17 Minutes Reports from Committee Representatives on University Committees and Joint Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Minutes received since last BC</i>
Admissions Assessments Steering Group	12 October 2023
Cambridge Outreach Strategy Group	5 October 2023
College Wellbeing Stimulus Fund	
Equality, Diversity & Inclusion Committee	23 May 2023
Human Resources Committee	15 June 2023
Information Services Committee	18 July 2023
Joint Student Numbers Management Group	<i>Has not met</i>
Mental Health Funding Task and Finish Group	13 October 2023
Societies Syndicate	
Undergraduate Admissions Committee	2 October 2023

FINAL DISCUSSIONS

BC.23.18 Energy Administrator

The Committee noted that Ms Ling Wong had recently been appointed to the role of Energy Administrator on behalf of the Colleges. Details of her working hours and duties were provided for information:

Paper 22 Energy Administrator, November 2023

BC.23.19 Future meetings

Meeting dates (dark blue) for 2023-24 are listed below, together with informal Network discussions (light blue):

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars’ Committee
MICHAELMAS TERM			
23 Nov 2023	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
LENT TERM			
25 Jan 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
8 Feb 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
22 Feb 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
29 Feb 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Murray Edwards
7 Mar 2024	2:00-3:30	Network Zoom	

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
EASTER TERM			
[Reserve: 25 April 2024]	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Magdalene
2 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
16 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
30 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
6 Jun 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Lucy Cavendish
13 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
4 Jul 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Newnham
11 Jul 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

BC.23.20 **Record of thanks**

On behalf of the Committee, the Chair thanked the Provost and Fellows of King's College for their generous hospitality.

BC.23.21 **Items of reserved business**

There was no reserved business.

2023-11-16 BC minutes

Matthew Russell
17 November 2023

Bursars' Committee

**MINUTES of the meeting held at 2.15 pm on Thursday, 29 February 2024
in the Long Room at Murray Edwards College.**

The meeting was chaired by the Chair (Richard Anthony, JE) and the minute taker was Matthew Russell (Office of Intercollegiate Services).

Attendance: Please note that blank cells below represent Colleges that were not represented at the meeting.

Christ's	Michael Parsons
Churchill	Tamsin James
Clare	Elizabeth Conder
Clare Hall	Per Reiff-Musgrove David James
Corpus Christi	Gemma Donaldson
Darwin	John Dix Giles Greenfield
Downing	Gavin Flynn Rob Beardwell
Emmanuel	Catherine Webb
Fitzwilliam	Rod Cantrill Hannah Fox
Girton	Jimmy Anderson Maureen Hackett
Gonville & Caius	Robert Gardiner
Homerton	
Hughes Hall	Patrick Dunne
Jesus	Richard Anthony
King's	Ivan Collister Polly Ingham
Lucy Cavendish	Tony McNiff
Magdalene	Steven Morris

Margaret Beaufort	
Ridley Hall	
Wesley House	

Murray Edwards	Rob Hopwood Charles Howard
Newnham	Christopher Lawrence
Pembroke	Catherine Rawlings
Peterhouse	Ian Wright
Queens'	Andrew Bainbridge
Robinson	Fiona Brockbank Rachel Hooper
St. Catharine's	Nicola Robert Helen Hayward
St. Edmund's	Graham Watson Rob Preston
St John's	Chris Ewbank
Selwyn	Jennifer Phillips
Sidney Sussex	Martin Pierce
Trinity	Richard Turnill Emma Davies
Trinity Hall	Tim Harvey-Samuel
Wolfson	Joanna Cheffins Darren Smith
Senior Tutors' Ctte	
Colleges' Ctte	Richard Heaton
Development Directors Ctte	

Westcott House	
Westminster	Simon Shinkfield

University	
OIS	Matthew Russell, Malcolm Millbrook and Diane Brooker

Len Dunne, Chief Executive Officer, of Curating Cambridge (formerly Fitzwilliam Museum Enterprises Ltd) attended the meeting for item BC.23.8

There were no declarations of interest.

BC.23.22 Welcome

The Committee welcomed the following to their first meeting:

- Patrick Dunne (HH, Assistant Bursar)
- Martin Pierce, Sidney Sussex College
- Sir Richard Heaton (R, Colleges' Committee representative)

BC.23.23 Minutes of the meeting held on 16 November 2023

The minutes of the meeting on 16 November 2023 were approved as a true record.

BC.23.24 Matters arising not elsewhere on the agenda

There are no matters arising not raised elsewhere on the agenda.

PRINCIPAL AND SUBSTANTIVE BUSINESS

BC.23.25 Presentation by Curating Cambridge Limited

Len Dunne, Chief Executive Officer, of Curating Cambridge (formerly Fitzwilliam Museum Enterprises Ltd) attended the meeting to outline the services that Curating Cambridge could provide to Colleges, and particularly in the form of College-branded merchandise:

Paper 1 Curating Cambridge Ltd

Bursars were asked to follow up directly with Curating Cambridge if they were interested in the services.

BC.23.26 #justiceforsupervisors Campaign

The Committee received for information:

Paper 2 J4CS Work plan

Paper 3 Minute extract, Bursars' Business Committee on 2 February 2024

Paper 26 Proposal for supervision uplift distribution

The Chair provided an update covering:

- a) that he, Malcolm Millbrook and Judith Bunbury (Associate Secretary of the Senior Tutors' Committee) were meeting representatives of the J4CS campaigners on a regular basis.
- b) recent discussions had focussed on (i) a survey of supervisors, (ii) enhancing the guidance for supervisors (particularly those who were relatively inexperienced), and (iii) addressing concerns over remuneration through discussions about the intercollegiate re-charge rates.
- c) his appreciation (and others) of the substantial time and work undertaken by Malcolm on behalf of the representatives on both sides of the table, and the Colleges more widely.
- d) re (i) the survey of supervisors, the high response rate (>30%) from supervisors of all Triposes, Colleges and surveys, and the wealth of information that would be available for both the J4CS discussions and the Teaching Review.
- e) re (ii) enhancing the guidance, the recent issue of draft parameters for future guidance to Colleges, Faculties and Departments, with further iterations likely depending on the feedback received.

- f) re (iii) concerns over remuneration, the development of a proposed methodology to set future intercollegiate re-charge rates, and the discussion of those proposals to date with the Business Committees of the Senior Tutors' Committee and the Bursars' Committee.

The Chair also noted the strong intersection of this work with the Teaching Review, and welcomed the public acknowledgement of this by the University. He noted that there was an early emerging consensus to reduce and limit the number of group size 1 (singleton) supervisions, where issues relating to pedagogy, safeguarding and staff workload were converging with the Bursarial conversations about financial sustainability of the supervision system.

Finally, the Chair drew attention to the "cost of living" uplift of supervision rates for 2023-24, which had been agreed for this one year only, and on a cost-sharing basis with the University, also for this one year only. He drew attention to the proposed distribution of the University's contribution across the Colleges, as set out in Paper 26. **The Committee approved the distribution of funds as set out in Paper 26.**

BC.23.27 Undergraduate supervision pay rate methodology for 2024-25

The Committee received for discussion:

Paper 4	Joint Bursars' Business Committee and Senior Tutors' Business Committee meeting – Minutes 26 January 2024
Paper 5	Minute extract: Senior Tutors' Committee – 16 February 2024
Paper 6	Calculating potential methodology pay rates

Attention was drawn to:

- a) all of the proposed models before the Committee were based on earlier discussions of the Business Committees of the Senior Tutors' Committee and the Bursars' Committee, which incorporated preliminary principles of a multiplier of 2.5 (representing 1.5 hours of preparation time for a 1 hour supervision) to a group size 2 (doubleton) supervision at the pay rate at the first scale point for a University Grade 6 role. It was noted that the position of J4CS was instead a multiplier of 4.0 to a singleton supervision at the first scale point of a University Grade 7 role.
- b) there were ongoing discussions with the University about whether it would contribute in 2024-25 to the "cost of living" uplift, if that were to continue.
- c) in the view of the Chair, the reversal or discontinuation of the £1.50 uplift agreed for 2023-24 would be challenging to agree across all of the 31 Colleges, and would likely attract unhelpful media and union attention.
- d) the hypothecated costs included in Paper 6 did not factor in either changes in policy on supervision size or proposals for any reduction of student contact time (supervision norms), noting the latter would directly address the current concerns about student workload.
- e) the need for Colleges to consider carefully and individually the impact of any of the proposals on College employees (i.e. College Teaching Officers and equivalent posts) and their contractual stints and other terms. It was recognised that this would vary substantially across Colleges.
- f) the Teaching Review and its recommendations and outcomes would progress more slowly than the J4CS expectations on any proposals relating to the intercollegiate re-charge rates. Consequently, it was felt that there remained a high risk that J4CS might call for a supervision boycott (of unknown timescale or duration).

Following a brief discussion and clarification of a number of technical points, the Committee supported the general direction of approach and there were no objections raised to the potential methodology proposals included in Paper 6.

BC.23.28 Cambridge Bursary Scheme

a) Review of the Cambridge Bursary Scheme

The Committee received for information the notes of the Cambridge Bursary Scheme Working Group on 7 December 2023:

Paper 7 CBSWG, notes of 7 December 2023

It noted the Working Group's recommendation to suspend its activities pending confirmation of the appetite of the Committee and the Colleges for a further revision of the Cambridge Bursary Scheme. **The Committee supported the recommendation, noting that there was still a general expectation that the parameters of the Scheme would remain under review over the longer term.**

b) Enhanced financial support for 5th and 6th year clinical medical students

The Committee received for discussion the following papers relating to the financial support offered to clinical medical students:

Paper 8 *Financial assistance for clinical medics*

Paper 9 Minute extracts: Fees and Student Finance Sub-Committee on 24 January 2024 and Senior Tutors' Committee on 16 February 2024

In a discussion about whether the Committee and the Colleges would support the formulation of a new bursary for 5th and 6th year clinical medical students, it noted the views expressed at the Senior Tutors' Committee and especially the identification of the issue being one of national relevance. It supported the view that the Clinical School should work with peer institutions to identify solutions to the challenges set out in the paper. **The Committee did not support the proposal to introduce an additional bursary scheme, but noted the need for ongoing engagement with the issues.**

OTHER MATTERS FOR DECISION

BC.23.29 Statutes relating to the Colleges Fund

The Committee received and supported a recommendation from the Colleges Fund Working Group to the University to move most of the clauses relating to the Colleges Fund (Statute G.II) into University Ordinances in order to facilitate future amendments to the operations of the Fund.

BC.23.30 Amendments to terms of reference

a) Colleges Fund Working Group

The Committee received and approved amendments to the Working Group's terms of reference, noting they were the result of the discussion at its last meeting:

Paper 10 Draft terms of reference: Colleges Fund Working Group

BC.23.31 Membership of Sub-Committees and Other Bodies

The Committee approved the following proposals for representation on other committees:

<i>on...</i>	<i>appointment of...</i>	<i>replacing...</i>
Access and Participation Plan Scrutiny Group	Ivan Collister (K)	<i>*New</i>
Fire Protection and Health & Safety Sub-Committee	Alison Cox (JN)	<i>*New</i>
ADRC Review Steering Group	Robert Gardiner (CAI)	<i>*New</i>

Attention was drawn to the following current or impending vacancies:

<i>on ...</i>	<i>replacing ...</i>
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	<i>Gemma Donaldson (CC)</i>
Sustainability Sub-Committee	<i>Gemma Donaldson (CC)</i>
Council Committee for the Supervision of the Student Unions	<i>Gemma Donaldson (CC)</i>
e-books/Library representative	<i>New</i>

STANDING BUSINESS – MATTERS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES FOR INFORMATION OR REPORT**BC.23.32 Bursars' Business Committee**

The minutes of the Bursars' Business Committee were received for information:

Paper 11 Minutes of the meeting on 30 November 2023

Paper 12 Minutes of the meeting on 2 February 2024

Matters arising from those minutes that require discussion had been raised elsewhere in the agenda.

BC.23.33 Planning Sub-Committee: A-Bid levy (accommodation charge)

Following discussions with Maria Manion, CEO of Cambridge BID, at the Network Meeting on 25 January 2024, the Committee received an update from the Chair of the Planning Sub-Committee:

Paper 13 A-Bid levy (accommodation charge)

Tim Harvey-Samuel (TH), as Chair of the Planning Sub-Committee, noted that there was a spectrum of views within the Sub-Committee about the points raised and that there was no need for this to be considered a "common action" issue, given that the importance of relevant business varied considerably across Colleges.

It was emphasised that the intersection of the A-BID with the mission of Meet Cambridge was minimal. A-BID was focussed on the tourist trade, whereas Meet Cambridge was focussed on commercial business and bookings.

Nevertheless, in order for the Planning Sub-Committee to be as informed as possible in future discussions, **members were reminded indicate their responses to the current online survey to OIS as soon as possible.**

BC.23.34 General Purchasing Sub-Committee: Colleges Insurance Buying Group update

The Committee was reminded of the tender documents previously circulated, and received here for the record:

- Paper 14 Cambridge Colleges' Insurer Tender 2024: Coversheet
- Paper 15 Cambridge Colleges' Insurer Tender 2024: Full report

Members were requested to contact Lizzy Conder (CL) with any detailed questions.

BC.23.35 Taxation Sub-Committee: 2023 Rating Revaluation

The Committee was reminded of the correspondence from Gerald Eve previously circulated, and received here for the record:

- Paper 16 2023 Rating Revaluation: Email from Gerald Eve
- Paper 17 Gerald Eve forecast liability schedule (as at 8 December 2023)

BC.23.36 Undergraduate Admissions Committee and Cambridge Admissions Management Group

The minutes of the Undergraduate Admissions Committee were received for information, together with an update on current progress towards providing new assessments for candidates applying in 2024:

- Paper 18 Minutes of Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 13 November 2023
- Paper 19 Minutes of Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 5 February 2024
- Paper 20 Update on Undergraduate Admissions Testing 2024-25, February 2024

Rod Cantrill (F) updated the Committee on important developments relating to the ESAT and TMUA assessments, noting:

- a) there was a current focus on the delivery of the 2024 assessments and good progress was being made.
- b) the associated bursary scheme and its costs were met within the operational charges of the scheme, and there were no direct or indirect costs to Colleges arising from it.
- c) the onboarding of other higher education institutions beyond the joint venture company was being considered carefully, and in the context of the overlap of applicants (to mitigate the risk of pressure on the available testing infrastructure). It was recognised that mainstreaming the assessments across the sector would be advantageous. Pearson Vue remained confident of their capacity to deliver the assessments this year.

BC.23.37 Joint Wellbeing Committee

The minutes of a recent meeting were received for information:

Paper 21 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 23 November 2023

Robert Gardiner (CAI) commented on financial projections received since the presentation by the Head of Wellbeing and the Programme Manager at the last meeting. He noted that the projections made at the previous meeting remained current, with an approximate £2M overspend by the Colleges against the planned position. He noted there was a reduction in of £0.3m in external counselling but uptake of wellbeing posts in Colleges had been far quicker than planned from £0.4m to a projected £1.6m. He further noted a marked increase of expenditure on College Nurses, and that further information was being gathered (from the annual salary surveys) to understand the reasons for this.

He urged Bursars to review the recently-circulated statistics about the uptake of the centralised student support services.

BC.23.38 Minutes and Reports from Sub-Committees and Other Intercollegiate Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Meetings since last BC</i>
<i>Bursar Sub-Committees</i>	
Fees and Student Finance Sub-Committee	29 November 2023 24 January 2024
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	7 December 2023 25 January 2024
Legal Affairs and Employment Sub-Committee	24 November 2023 26 January 2024
Planning Sub-Committee	1 February 2024
Sustainability Sub-Committee	1 February 2024
Taxation Sub-Committee	22 November 2023
<i>Other Intercollegiate Committees</i>	
Technical Sub-Committee of ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
Colleges' Committee	3 February 2024
College Development Directors' Committee	14 February 2024
Colleges' IT Committee	31 January 2024
Colleges' Standing Committee	21 November 2023 23 January 2024
Senior Tutors' Committee	1 December 2023 16 February 2024 (bulletin)
Undergraduate Admissions Committee	5 February 2024
University and Colleges Joint Committee	28 November 2023 30 January 2024

Reports had been received from the following:

Sub-Committee	Chair	Written report for this BC
Colleges' IT Committee	Jennifer Phillips (SEL)	Paper 22
Fees and Funding Sub-Committee	Andrew Cates (PEM)	Paper 23
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	Lizzie Conder (CL)	See agenda item 16
Legal Affairs & Employment Sub-Committee	Jo Cheffins (W)	Paper 24
Planning Sub-Committee	Tim Harvey Samuel (TH)	See agenda item 17
Taxation Sub-Committee	Lizzy Conder (CL)	See agenda item 18

BC.23.39 Minutes Reports from Committee Representatives on University Committees and Joint Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Minutes received since last BC</i>
Admissions Assessments Steering Group	9 February 2024
Cambridge Outreach Strategy Group	7 February 2024
College Wellbeing Stimulus Fund	<i>No minutes</i>
Communicable Diseases, Sub-Committee for	29 January 2024
Equality, Diversity & Inclusion Committee	<i>No minutes</i>
Human Resources Committee	<i>No minutes</i>
Information Services Committee	23 November 2023
Joint Committee on Childcare for Students	18 December 2023
Joint Student Numbers Management Group	<i>Has not met</i>
Mental Health Funding Task and Finish Group	13 October 2023
Societies Syndicate	<i>No minutes</i>

Reports had been received from the following:

Committee	Representative(s)	Written report for this BC
Information Services Committee: Annual Report 2022-23	Jennifer Phillips (SE)	Paper 25

Jennifer Phillips (SE) highlighted some elements relating to the Annual Report and recent UIS initiatives. She drew attention to a Heads of House Café on 1 March 2024, where she would be outlining the roles of the Colleges IT Committee and the Joint Infrastructure Group in reviewing policies and setting common technical standards. She noted the recent approval by the University of three policies designed to improve digital data security (the Acceptable Use policy, the email address retention policy and an associated College pilot, and the Systems Management policy). She advised Bursars to discuss with their IT Managers how they were engaging with work emerging from the Joint Infrastructure Group about common technical standards.

FINAL DISCUSSIONS**BC.23.40 A recent cyber-incident**

The Chair briefed the Committee confidentially on a recent cyber-incident (referencing a communication received yesterday by all College senior officers). He noted that he had encouraged the University to consider how it would consider the communication of such incidents in the event of the loss of email services, and encouraged Bursars to think likewise about this challenge as part of their business continuity plans.

BC.23.41 Engaging collectively over audit services

Bursars were invited to contact Fiona Brockbank (R) if they wished to engage collectively with a common audit firm.

BC.23.42 Bursars' Partners Lunch

Bursars were invited to contact Robert Gardiner (CAI) if they were interested in committing their College and their partner to host this year's Lunch.

BC.23.43 Future meetings

Meeting dates (dark blue) for 2023-24 are listed below, together with informal Network discussions (light blue):

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
LENT TERM			
7 Mar 2024	2:00-3:30	Network Zoom	
EASTER TERM			
[Reserve: 25 April 2024]	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Magdalene
2 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
16 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
30 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
6 Jun 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Lucy Cavendish
13 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
27 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
4 Jul 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Newnham
11 Jul 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	

BC.23.44 Future meetings 2024-25

Confirmed meeting dates for the 2024-25 are set out below: **members were invited to note these for their diaries.**

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
MICHAELMAS TERM			
10 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
24 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
7 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
14 Nov 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
21 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
LENT TERM			
23 Jan 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
6 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
20 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Feb 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
6 Mar 2025	2:00-3:30	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
EASTER TERM			
24 April 2025 [Reserve for Levies business]	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
1 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
15 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
29 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
5 Jun 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
13 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
26 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
3 Jul 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
10 Jul 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

BC.23.45 Farewell

It was noted that this was the last meeting for Gemma Donaldson (CC), and she was wished well as she takes up her new post as Bursar of St Cross College, Oxford.

BC.23.46 Record of thanks

On behalf of the Committee, the Chair thanked the President and Fellows of Murray Edwards College for their generous hospitality.

BC.23.47 Items of reserved business

There were no items of reserved business.

2024-02-29 BC minutes

Matthew Russell
29 February 2024

Bursars' Committee

**MINUTES of an extraordinary meeting held at 2.15 pm on Thursday, 16 May 2024
in Jesus College.**

The meeting was chaired by the Chair (Richard Anthony, JE) and the minute taker was Matthew Russell (Office of Intercollegiate Services).

Attendance: Please note that blank cells below represent Colleges that were not represented at the meeting.

Christ's	Michael Parsons
Churchill	
Clare	Toby Wilkinson
Clare Hall	Per Reiff-Musgrove
Corpus Christi	Jenny Raine
Darwin	
Downing	Gavin Flynn
Emmanuel	Catherine Webb
Fitzwilliam	Rod Cantrill
Girton	Maureen Hackett
Gonville & Caius	Robert Gardiner
Homerton	
Hughes Hall	Jonathan Newby
Jesus	Richard Anthony
King's	Ivan Collister
Lucy Cavendish	Tony McNiff
Magdalene	

Margaret Beaufort	
Ridley Hall	
Wesley House	

Murray Edwards	
Newnham	Christopher Lawrence
Pembroke	Catherine Rawlings
Peterhouse	Ian Wright
Queens'	
Robinson	Fiona Brockbank
St. Catharine's	Nicola Robert
St. Edmund's	Graham Watson
St John's	
Selwyn	Jennifer Phillips
Sidney Sussex	Martin Pierce
Trinity	Emma Davies
Trinity Hall	Tim Harvey-Samuel
Wolfson	Joanna Cheffins
Senior Tutors' Ctte	Marina Frasca-Spada Judith Bunbury
Colleges' Ctte	
Dev. Directors Ctte	

Westcott House	
Westminster	Simon Shinkfield

University	
OIS	Matthew Russell and Malcolm Millbrook

There were no declarations of interest.

BC.23.48 Welcome

The Committee welcomed the following to their first meeting:

- Toby Wilkinson, Clare College (Acting Bursar)
- Judith Bunbury (Chair-Elect of the Senior Tutors' Committee)

The Committee noted that both Lizzy Conder and Emma Easterbrook had left their positions at Clare College.

The two Senior Tutors' Committee officers noted that they had a conflict of interest in relation to the matters discussed at the meeting, in that they were in receipt of pay connected to the intercollegiate supervision re-charge rates.

BC.23.49 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 29 February 2024 were received for information but would be confirmed at the next regular meeting of the Committee on 6 June 2024.

PRINCIPAL AND SUBSTANTIVE BUSINESS**BC.23.50 #justiceforsupervisors Campaign (14 March February 2024, minute BBC.23.44)**

The Committee received for information two published interpretations of data presented in response to an initial report of a supervisor workload survey

(available at www.seniortutors.admin.cam.ac.uk/files/supervisor_workload_survey_report.pdf):

- | | |
|---------|--|
| Paper 1 | Colleges' interpretation of survey data |
| Paper 2 | Campaigners' interpretation of survey data |

The Chair of the Bursars' Committee updated the Committee on the significant developments since the last meeting, including meetings with the campaigners. He noted that:

- a) the meetings with the campaigners had continued to be constructive and cordial.
- b) the published report was predicated on a 35% and broadly representative response rate from supervisors, and represented the most detailed and substantial report on the supervision system to date. Malcolm Millbrook was enthusiastically thanked for the extensive work and very useful presentation of the data.
- c) the resulting data was able to be interpreted in a number of ways (as Papers 1 and 2 demonstrated) and it was clear that the experiences of individual supervisors were extremely varied. This supported the work of the Senior Tutors' Committee (and outlined in the programme of work) to provide greater clarity on the expectations of undergraduate supervisors, and the data itself had provided good insight into the key areas of improvement in that guidance.

Malcolm Millbrook also updated the Committee on the work being conducted as part of the University's Review on Teaching. The Review Steering Group had supported the recommendations that Faculties and Departments also improved the clarity of their expectations of supervisors in their subjects but had not to date set any timetables for that work to be completed: it was emphasised therefore that reforms to the supervision system would likely proceed at different rates in different subjects. Attention was drawn also to the potential implications for the terms of employment of College Teaching Officers in the event of substantial changes to the supervision system, and the need for these to be reviewed by Colleges to ensure that they were not materially financially impacted.

The Committee agreed that individual Bursars should look at their employment contracts for teaching staff and their current terms, in the light of changing expectations around the delivery of supervisions and in particular the possibility of a reduction in the number of singleton supervisions.

BC.23.51 Undergraduate supervision pay rate methodology (was #justiceforsupervisors Campaign (14 March 2024, minute BBC.23.45)**COMMON ACTION DECISION**

The Chair introduced the primary business of the extraordinary meeting, which was to agree changes to the intercollegiate supervision re-charge rates in the light of ongoing discussions with J4CS representatives. As context, the Committee received:

- | | |
|---------|---|
| Paper 3 | An updated rates methodology spreadsheet (version 14) |
| Paper 4 | J4CS e-mail, dated 23 April 2024 |
| Paper 5 | minutes from a joint meeting of the Bursars' and Senior Tutors' Business Committees, 9 May 2024 |
| Paper 6 | J4CS e-mail, dated 16 May 2024 (<i>shared on screen at the meeting</i>) |

During the meeting, the Committee noted the evolution of a number of methodology proposals and their financial implications and focussed its attention on the two rates described as “J4CS 23 April proposal sp39” and “College discussion between Bursars” in Paper 3. In doing it, the Chair emphasised that there was general accord with J4CS about the underlying principles of the methodology (including pegging any rates to a University spine point – with specific agreement on point 39, it being partway through grade 6 and the bottom point of grade 7, and differentiation between group sizes on a stepped amount to reflect additional marking time per student). The College representatives had stressed from their perspective the importance of focussing on doubleton supervisions as the most common group size for supervisions.

The Chair outlined that earlier proposals had met with concerns from the J4CS representatives that the proposed 2024-25 increase for singleton supervisions would be too low (3%) for their members and had proposed a “2.1 multiplier” instead specifically for that group size (representing an 8% increase on 2023-24 rates). He noted that Paper 6 was an email received immediately prior to the meeting, which outlined reactions to the two current proposals, and the Committee discussed the feasibility of the proposed terms outlined in the email. There was general agreement that the first and sixth points were acceptable (regarding a review of the agreed programme of work and its timetable, and to plan for an updated survey of supervisors in 2027-28 respectively), that the seventh point was one that could be explored (regarding a “standardised deadline for CamCORS report submission”, notwithstanding the intrinsic challenges of harmonising the pay systems and processes across 31 Colleges), but there was reluctance to link any of the other terms to any conclusion of this matter, given their more intrinsic links to the outcomes of the Teaching Review.

In considering a formal proposal, the Committee noted that the recommendation from the joint meeting of the Bursars’ and Senior Tutors’ Business Committees was to move forward with the “J4CS 23 April proposal sp39” noting the rationale set out from that meeting. During the discussion, the following points were made:

- a) It would be important to draw a line under discussions about the methodology and that agreement should be sought from J4CS to not re-visit this matter for four years (during which time reform of the supervision system arising from the Review of Teaching should take place).
- b) there was no guarantee of any University subsidy for supervision costs continuing beyond 2023-24, which would mean the % increase in hypothecated costs for Colleges would be marginally higher than those stated in Paper 3 (the increase was shown to those presented in the form of an updated spreadsheet).
- c) this new methodology would represent the third year in which the Colleges had approved increases in the intercollegiate supervision re-charge rates substantially above the national UCEA-UCU agreements.

The Committee therefore agreed to set the 2024-25 intercollegiate rates as follows:¹

	2024-25	2023-24	% increase	Rate per student
Group size 1	£38.52	£35.72	8%	£38.52
Group size 2	£45.86	£41.94	9%	£22.93
Group size 3	£55.03	£48.16	14%	£18.34
Group size 4+	£64.21	£50.92	26%	

It noted that, while there was not an intention to re-visit this matter at future meetings this year, the Chair would reserve the right to bring the matter back to a future meeting. One possible reason would be if the UCEA-UCU increase for 2024-25 (yet to be confirmed) differs from the assumption of 3% used in the calculations in Paper 3 (and therefore the resulting pay rates above).

¹ Of the Colleges not formally represented at the meeting, the following Colleges had provided formal agreement to the above proposal in writing before the meeting: CHU, M, Q, JN.

FINAL DISCUSSIONS**BC.23.52 Future meetings**

Remaining Meeting dates (dark blue) for 2023-24 are listed below, together with informal Network discussions (light blue):

2023-24

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
EASTER TERM			
30 May 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
6 Jun 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Lucy Cavendish
13 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
4 Jul 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Newnham
11 Jul 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

2024-25

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
MICHAELMAS TERM			
10 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
24 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
7 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
14 Nov 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
21 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
LENT TERM			
23 Jan 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
6 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
20 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Feb 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
6 Mar 2025	2:00-3:30	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
EASTER TERM			
24 April 2025 [Reserve for Levies business]	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
1 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
15 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
29 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
5 Jun 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
13 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
26 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
3 Jul 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting tbc
10 Jul 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

BC.23.53 Record of thanks

The Committee thanked the Master and Fellows of Jesus College for their generous hospitality.

BC.23.54 Items of reserved business

There was no reserved business.

2024-05-16 BC minutes

Dr M Russell
17 May 2024

Bursars' Committee

**MINUTES of the meeting held at 2.15 pm on Thursday, 6 June 2024
in the Wood-Legh Room at Lucy Cavendish College.**

The meeting was chaired by the Chair (Richard Anthony, JE) and the minute taker was Matthew Russell (Office of Intercollegiate Services).

Attendance: Please note that blank cells below represent Colleges that were not represented at the meeting.

Christ's	Michael Parsons
Churchill	Tamsin James
Clare	Toby Wilkinson
Clare Hall	Per Reiff-Musgrove
Corpus Christi	Jenny Raine David Secher
Darwin	John Dix
Downing	Gavin Flynn
Emmanuel	Catherine Webb
Fitzwilliam	Rod Cantrill Hannah Fox
Girton	Jimmy Anderson
Gonville & Caius	Robert Gardiner
Homerton	Simon Brockington
Hughes Hall	Jonathan Newby
Jesus	Richard Anthony
King's	Polly Ingham
Lucy Cavendish	Tony McNiff Tatjana Walker
Magdalene	Steven Morris Helen Foord

Murray Edwards	Rob Hopwood
Newnham	Christopher Lawrence
Pembroke	Andrew Cates Catherine Rawlings
Peterhouse	Ian Wright
Queens'	
Robinson	Fiona Brockbank Rachel Hooper
St. Catharine's	Nicola Robert Helen Hayward
St. Edmund's	Graham Watson Rob Preston
St John's	Chris Ewbank
Selwyn	Jennifer Phillips
Sidney Sussex	Martin Pierce Kathryn Smart
Trinity	Richard Turnill Emma Davies
Trinity Hall	Tim Harvey-Samuel
Wolfson	Joanna Cheffins Darren Smith
Senior Tutors' Ctte	Marina Frasca Spada
Colleges' Ctte	Richard Heaton
Development Directors Ctte	

Margaret Beaufort	
Ridley Hall	
Wesley House	

Westcott House	
Westminster	

University	Alice Benton, the University's Head of Education Services David Cardwell, the University's Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Planning and Resources) Anthony Odgers, the University's Chief Financial Officer (item BC.23.71 only) Kamal Munir the University's Pro-Vice-Chancellor (University Community and Engagement) (item BC.23.71 only)
OIS	Matthew Russell, Malcolm Millbrook and Diane Brooker

Potential conflicts of interest were noted for those present who were in receipt of salaries or stipends arising from intercollegiate levies (minute BC.23.59). These were not considered significant enough for anyone to be recused from the discussions or decisions.

BC.23.55 Welcome

The Committee welcomed David Secher (CC) back to the Committee.

BC.23.56 Minutes of previous meetings

The Committee approved the unreserved minutes of the meetings on 29 February 2024 and 16 May 2024 as true records.

PRINCIPAL AND SUBSTANTIVE BUSINESS

BC.23.57 Secretary of the Bursars' Committee

The Chair reported that Robert Gardiner would be stepping down as the Senior Bursar of Gonville & Caius College at some point in the next academic year, and therefore would resign from his post as Secretary of Bursars' Committee on 31 December 2024. He outlined the formal process for the election of a Secretary, noting that the current procedures did not provide explicitly for an election outside of the usual appointment cycle. **The Committee agreed to commence the process with immediate effect, and to schedule the election to occur early in the Michaelmas Term:** it was expected that the successful candidate would commence the post from 1 January 2025 and would serve for a shortened term, until they succeeded Richard Anthony as Chair when he stood down.

The Chair and the Committee warmly thanked Robert Gardiner for his work on, and support for, the Bursars' Committee in many roles, including the Secretary.

BC.23.58 #justiceforsupervisors Campaign

The Committee received for information the formal terms of agreement for intercollegiate supervisions re-charge rates for 2024-25, following its meeting on 16 May 2024:

Paper 1 Terms of agreement, 17 May 2024

The Chair noted the terms had been circulated to Bursars on 31 May 2024 in advance of the meeting, following agreement by the J4CS representatives. He noted that there would be a pause in further meetings until next year, where work would commence on contractual arrangements. He noted specifically that he had advised the Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Education) of the expectation that the University would need to engage in those discussions, given the nature of the demands of the campaigners.

The Committee was reminded that UCU was not recognised by the Colleges, collectively or individually and its participation was part of its wider local and national campaign about the casualisation of employment in higher education. It also had been prominent recently in a separate campaign about the pay conditions of researchers, with a report that relied on a very small sample of College Research Fellows.

BC.23.59 Annual levy proposals for 2024-25

COMMON ACTION DECISION

The Committee received the report of the Levies Panel with recommendations for 2024-25 and confirmed sums for levies that would be requested of Colleges for 2024-25 (Paper 4):

Paper 2 Report from the Levies Panel: Intercollegiate levies 2023-24
 Paper 3 Intercollegiate levies workbook 2024-25

The Chair of the Levies Panel drew attention particularly to paragraphs 3 and 9 of Paper 2, which outlined changes to its recommendations circulated in its report in March to Bursars. He otherwise noted that the process this year had been relatively straightforward. In addition, it was noted:

- a) there had been a recurrent levy request for “digital admissions”, which the Levies Panel had now recommended to be a one-year levy, noting the concerns raised about the accountability mechanisms for the project and the lack of assurances about commitment of resources from UIS.
- b) the Levies Panel had received and rejected a request from the Clinical School for funding towards its support services to clinical students. The Panel felt that further research and information was needed to demonstrate the effectiveness and value added of the service, over and above the support services provided by Colleges and the University’s central services.
- c) costs for 2025-26 would likely be higher than those outlined in 2024-25, as the outcomes from the Mental Health Change Programme were concluded (attention was drawn to Paper 14, where ongoing discussions about potential bases for the sharing of costs were outlined).
- d) Helpful contributions to the work of the Panel were made by Nick Tamkin (towards developing a clear process for the prioritisation of levy requests from the University) and Alistair Flett (who had provided a more thorough analysis of the value of the e-books levy).

Richard Heaton (R), the Colleges’ Committee representative on the Levies Panel, also noted his support for the recommendations and noted that the process was thorough and fair.

The Committee thanked Jimmy Anderson and Malcolm Millbrook for their comprehensive and detailed management of the process, and for the clarity and transparency of the reports. **It agreed to the levies from Colleges, as set out in Paper 4.**

BC.23.60 Colleges Fund Review

The Committee received the first interim report of the Colleges Fund Working Group:

Paper 4 CFWG, First Interim Report, May 2024

The Chair, in introducing the report and its recommendations, noted:

- a) much of the time of the Working Group had been spent clarifying the expectations of Bursars of its remit, and then gathering relevant information, through archives and consultation with officers of the University committees and Bursars. The Working Group was particularly grateful to Jonathan Spence for his input and insight as a long-standing member of the Colleges Fund Committee.
- b) he had met with 11 Colleges to date, including the six largest donors to the Fund and five of the recipient Colleges. He was keen to meet with other Bursars, who were urged to get in touch to schedule a meeting.
- c) the recommendations of the interim report focussed on either identified improvements to processes and/or transparency, or were indicative of the direction of travel of the discussions of the Working Group.
- d) it was important to remember that the Working Group could only advise the Assessment Sub-Committee and the Colleges Fund Committee of its proposals and would only do so with the support of the Committee. (It was therefore clarified that the report had not yet been formally received by either of the committees mentioned, though both of these had Bursars among their membership.)

In the discussion of the recommendations, it was observed that:

- i) Bursars who were members of the Assessment Sub-Committee and the Colleges Fund Committee noted that many of the recommendations would already align with existing work by those committees in reviewing the operations of the Fund. This was particularly true for the recommendations relating to the grant allocation process of the Colleges Fund Committee, and it was already accepted that closer working with OIS would be advantageous.
- ii) care and attention would need to be paid to the governance of the Fund, due to the nature of it being a fund that effectively managed grants between independent charities. The “arm’s length” management by the University was important to demonstrate appropriate objectivity.
- iii) there was strong agreement about the need for additional clarity and transparency, and the contrast of information and communications relating to the Colleges Fund and the levies process was noted.
- iv) in terms of clarifying the purposes, it was stressed that recommendations J and K reflected very much that this was an interim report and was intended to indicate a direction of travel. These recommendations related to a general and broad agreement that:
 - a. the primary purpose of the Colleges Fund was to build financial resilience in the less-well-endowed Colleges.
 - b. The primary purpose of the grants awarded by the Colleges Fund Committee was to provide Colleges with funds to enhance their permanent endowment, but that some flexibility to address complex or unusual circumstances was welcomed.

Members of the Bursars’ Committee noted that terms such as “primary purpose” and “financial resilience” would require clearer definition and explanation in due course: concerns were expressed that the current wording was open to a wide interpretation.
- v) attention was also drawn to the current absence of the purpose of the Fund and the grants, with it being solely at the discretion of the Colleges Fund Committee and able to be amended at any time. It was noted that there had been circumstances where that flexibility had been advantageous (particularly noting the period during and after the COVID pandemic). It was noted that any restrictions on the purposes of any Colleges Fund grant was set out in the award letter from the Committee and this practice was unlikely to change in the short term.
- vi) the Working Group had set out its anticipated future work and timetable in paragraphs 27-28 of the report.

The Bursars’ Committee accepted the first interim report and indicated their broad and general support of its recommendations. It commended the report to the Colleges Fund Committee and the Assessment Sub-Committee. It further endorsed the ongoing work of the Colleges Fund Working Group.

BC.23.61 Revisions to the protocol for the commissioning of external legal advice

The Committee received and approved a proposal recommended by the Legal Affairs and Employment Sub-Committee for revisions to the protocol for the commissioning of external legal advice, subject to the re-insertion of the first sentence of 10(d)(i) (which re-affirmed the requirement to inform all Colleges if external legal advice was being sought on their behalf):

Paper 5 Commissioning of external legal advice

BC.23.62 Reforms to supervision norms, including group sizes

The Committee’s attention was drawn to the Review of Teaching and the likelihood of reforms to supervision norms in certain Triposes. Individual Bursars were advised to check carefully whether reforms to supervision volumes and group sizes would impact their College employees (College Teaching Officers and others), especially where there are contractual terms about teaching stints.

BC.23.63 Size and Shape

The Chair reported that, at its last meeting, the University and Colleges Joint Committee had agreed to dissolve the Joint Working Group on Size and Shape. He noted that progress on the currently-in-draft Memorandum of Understanding (with the University) on Full-Time Student Numbers had stalled, while it was awaiting the formation of a “successor agreement” of the financial backstop element. It was confirmed that any such agreement would be between only the Accept All Colleges and the University.

Bursars of the Accept All Colleges (ED, HH, LC, W) noted that the discussions had included recognition that they were all in different positions regarding their student number aspirations and current shortfalls as a result of postgraduate under-recruitment of the University. Agreement on a workable successor agreement for 2024-25 had been started very late but was nearing completion: work was needed for a four-year plan thereafter and this had not yet begun.

The Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Planning and Resources) noted the challenges and difficulty of agreeing the initial financial backstop. He further noted that, should the University meet its postgraduate recruitment targets, the issues would likely focus on the need for greater intercollegiate management of student numbers.

OTHER MATTERS FOR DECISION**BC.23.64 Amendments to terms of reference****a) Fees and Student Funding Sub-Committee**

The Committee approved a minor amendment to the terms of reference of the Fees and Student Funding Sub-Committee (permitting the sub-committee to conduct its business by circulation as appropriate):

Paper 6 Draft terms of reference: Fees and Student Funding Sub-Committee

b) Levies Panel

The Committee approved an amendment to the terms of reference of the Levies Panel (permitting the Panel to engage with the University on the prioritisation and co-ordination of levies requested by the University and the appropriate use of intercollegiate funding, and updating references to other institutions):

Paper 7 Draft terms of reference: Levies Panel

BC.23.65 Membership of Sub-Committees and Other Bodies

The Committee approved the following proposals for representation on other committees:

<i>on...</i>	<i>appointment of...</i>	<i>replacing...</i>
Fire Protection and Health & Safety Sub-Committee (Chair)	Helen Foord (M)	Emma Easterbrook (CL)
Fire Protection and Health & Safety Sub-Committee	Kathryn Smart (SID)	Emma Easterbrook (CL)
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	Rob Preston (ED)	Gemma Donaldson (CC)
Legal Affairs & Employment Sub-Committee	Emma Davis (T) and Graham Watson (ED)	Emma Easterbrook (CL)

<i>on...</i>	<i>appointment of...</i>	<i>replacing...</i>
Sustainability Sub-Committee	Jonathan Newby (HH) Catherine Webb (EM)	Gemma Donaldson (CC)
Taxation Sub-Committee	Catherine Webb (EM) - Chair Fiona Brockbank (R) Karen Wall (CTH)	Lizzie Conder (CL) Mike Haddock (DOW)
Advisory Committee for Working with Offenders	Dave Prinsep (CHU)	Emma Easterbrook (CL)
Cambridge in America (Treasurer)* and Joint Committee on Development (ex officio)	Rod Cantrill (F) (<i>proposed to Cam but an approval for JCD needed</i>)	Gavin Flynn (DOW)
Council Committee for the Supervision of the Student Unions	Karen Ball (CAI)	Gemma Donaldson (CC)
Estates Committee**	Rod Cantrill (F)	Gavin Flynn (DOW)
Joint Wellbeing Committee	Tamsin James	Jenny Raine (CC)
Mental Health Data & Metrics T&F	Martin Pierce (SID)	Jenny Raine (CC)
Mental Health Funding T&F	Fiona Brockbank (R)	Jenny Raine (CC)

* CAm Board appointment **University Council appointment

Attention was drawn to the following current vacancy:

<i>on ...</i>	<i>replacing ...</i>
General Purchasing Sub-Committee (Chair)	Lizzy Conder (CL)

Bursars were reminded to check their current list of memberships on the OIS intranet and update OIS of any errors or omissions: <https://www.colleges.cam.ac.uk/committees/Committees.aspx>

STANDING BUSINESS – MATTERS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES FOR INFORMATION OR REPORT

BC.23.66 Bursars' Business Committee

The minutes of the Bursars' Business Committee were received for information:

- Paper 8 Minutes of the meeting on 14 March 2024
- Paper 9 Minutes of the meeting on 9 May 2024

Matters arising from those minutes that require discussion had been raised elsewhere in the agenda.

BC.23.67 Undergraduate Admissions Committee and Cambridge Admissions Management Group

The Committee received for information the minutes of the Undergraduate Admissions Committee, together with an update on current progress towards providing new assessments for candidates applying in 2024:

- Paper 10 Minutes of Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 13 May 2024
- Paper 11 Update on Undergraduate Admissions Testing 2024-25, May 2024

Rod Cantrill (F) noted the ongoing developments of the new UAT-UK tests and the growing interest of other universities. The arrangements at the University of Oxford (for the short term) and their difference in approach was also noted.

BC.23.68 Student Support committees

The Committee received for information the minutes of recent meetings of the Joint Wellbeing Committee and the Mental Health:

- Paper 12 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 7 March 2024
- Paper 13 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 25 April 2024
- Paper 14 Minutes of the Mental Health Funding Task and Finish Group, 3 May 2024

Attention was drawn to the costs of mental health provision from 2025-26 at the conclusion of the Mental Health Change Programme: a number of current services (especially screening services and a proposed NHS Hub) were currently being funded by short-term philanthropic funding and the ongoing commitment of Colleges and the University to funding these would need significant consideration.

BC.23.69 Minutes and Reports from Sub-Committees and Other Intercollegiate Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Meetings since last BC</i>
<i>Bursar Sub-Committees</i>	
Fees and Student Finance Sub-Committee	1 May 2024
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	7 March 2024 9 May 2024
Legal Affairs and Employment Sub-Committee	5 May 2024
Planning Sub-Committee	<i>No minutes</i>
Sustainability Sub-Committee	9 May 2024
Taxation Sub-Committee	21 March 2024
<i>Other Intercollegiate Committees</i>	
Technical Sub-Committee of ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
ICCA	<i>No minutes</i>
Colleges' Committee	11 May 2024
College Development Directors' Committee	14 February 2024 22 May 2024
Colleges' IT Committee	8 May 2024
Colleges' Standing Committee	5 March 2024 30 April 2024
Senior Tutors' Committee	16 February 2024 15 March 2024 24 May 2024
Undergraduate Admissions Committee	5 February 2024 11 March 2024
University and Colleges Joint Committee	7 May 2024

Reports had been received from the following:

Sub-Committee	Chair	Written report for this BC
Colleges' IT Committee	Jennifer Phillips (SEL)	15
Fees and Funding Sub-Committee	Andrew Cates (PEM)	16
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	Vacant	<i>No report</i>
Legal Affairs & Employment Sub-Committee	Jo Cheffins (W)	17
Planning Sub-Committee	Tim Harvey Samuel (TH)	<i>No report</i>
Taxation Sub-Committee	Vacant	<i>No report</i>

BC.23.70 Minutes and Reports from Committee Representatives on University Committees and Joint Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Minutes received since last BC</i>
Admissions Assessments Steering Group	9 February 2024
Cambridge Outreach Strategy Group	7 February 2024
College Wellbeing Stimulus Fund	<i>No minutes</i>
Communicable Diseases, Sub-Committee for	<i>No minutes</i>
Equality, Diversity & Inclusion Committee	31 October 2023
Human Resources Committee	19 October 2023
Information Services Committee	22 January 2024 26 March 2024
Joint Committee on Childcare for Students	<i>No minutes</i>
Joint Student Numbers Management Group	27 February 2024
Mental Health Funding Task and Finish Group	3 May 2024 (Paper 14)
Student Numbers Management Group	27 February 2024
Societies Syndicate	<i>No minutes</i>

FINAL DISCUSSIONS

BC.23.71 University Pay

The Chief Financial Officer and the Pro-Vice Chancellor (University Community and Engagement) attended the meeting to share confidential information on the University's emerging proposals about employee pay.

The discussion included highlighting the different application or use of the University's pay spine by various Colleges and therefore the different consequences that arise for the University and all Colleges from different cost-of-living solutions for different pay grade profiles on any local or linked pay spine. The University felt that in some areas it was not as competitive on associated benefits as other Russell Group universities and was considering steps to address this.

The Chief Financial Officer thanked Committee members for their feedback, and he and the Chair would maintain regular contact on the matter. The Committee asked that Colleges should be kept informed of any further developments, which could include University representatives attending a Bursars' Network meeting later this Term.

BC.23.72 **Future meetings**

Remaining meeting dates (dark blue) for 2023-24 are listed below, together with informal Network discussions (light blue):

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
EASTER TERM			
13 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Jun 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
4 Jul 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting: Newnham
11 Jul 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

Suggested meeting dates for the 2024-25 are set out below:

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
MICHAELMAS TERM			
10 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
24 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
7 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
14 Nov 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting Pembroke
21 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
LENT TERM			
23 Jan 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
6 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
20 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
27 Feb 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting Peterhouse
6 Mar 2025	2:00-3:30	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
EASTER TERM			
24 April 2025 [Reserve for Levies business]	2:00-4:00		Meeting Queens'
1 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
15 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
29 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
5 Jun 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting Robinson
12 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
26 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	
3 Jul 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting St Catharine's
10 Jul 2025	2:00-3:00	Network <i>Zoom</i>	

BC.23.73 **Farewells**

The Committee wished Lizzie Conder (CL), Emma Easterbrook (CL) and Jenny Raine (CC) well in their future endeavours. All three were thanked for their years of service.

BC.23.74 **Record of thanks**

On behalf of the Committee, the Chair thanked the President and Fellows of Lucy Cavendish College for their generous hospitality.

BC.23.75 Items of reserved business

There were no items of reserved business.

2024-06-06 BC minutes

Matthew Russell
7 June 2024

Bursars' Committee

**MINUTES of the meeting held at 2.15 pm on Thursday, 4 July 2024
in Cynthia Beerbower Room, Newnham College.**

The meeting was chaired by the Chair (Richard Anthony, JE) and the minute taker was Matthew Russell (Office of Intercollegiate Services).

Attendance: Please note that blank cells below represent Colleges that were not represented at the meeting.

Christ's	Michael Parsons
Churchill	Tamsin James
Clare	Keith Carne
Clare Hall	David James
Corpus Christi	David Secher Simon Shinkfield
Darwin	John Dix Giles Greenfield
Downing	Gavin Flynn
Emmanuel	
Fitzwilliam	Rod Cantrill
Girton	Jimmy Anderson
Gonville & Caius	Robert Gardiner
Homerton	Simon Brockington
Hughes Hall	Jonathan Newby
Jesus	Richard Anthony
King's	Ivan Collister
Lucy Cavendish	Tony McNiff
Magdalene	Steven Morris Helen Foord

Margaret Beaufort	
Ridley Hall	
Wesley House	

Murray Edwards	Rob Hopwood
Newnham	Christopher Lawrence Wendy Evans
Pembroke	Andrew Cates Catherine Rawlings
Peterhouse	
Queens'	
Robinson	Fiona Brockbank Rachel Hooper
St. Catharine's	Nicola Robert Helen Hayward
St. Edmund's	Graham Watson Rob Preston
St John's	Chris Ewbank
Selwyn	Jennifer Phillips
Sidney Sussex	Martin Pierce
Trinity	Richard Turnill
Trinity Hall	Tim Harvey-Samuel
Wolfson	Joanna Cheffins Darren Smith
Senior Tutors' Ctte	Marina Frasca Spada
Colleges' Ctte	Richard Heaton
Development Directors Ctte	

Westcott House	
Westminster	

University	Alice Benton, the University's Head of Education Services
OIS	Matthew Russell, Malcolm Millbrook and Diane Brooker

There were no declarations of interest.

BC.23.76 Welcome

The Committee welcomed the following members to new roles in the Colleges:

- Keith Carne (CL, Interim Bursar)
- Simon Shinkfield (CC, Interim Domus Bursar)

BC.23.77 Minutes of previous meetings

The Committee approved the unreserved minutes of the meeting on 6 June 2024 as a true record.

BC.23.78 Matters arising not elsewhere on the agenda

There were no matters arising not elsewhere on the agenda.

PRINCIPAL AND SUBSTANTIVE BUSINESS**BC.23.79 Election of a new Deputy Chair (was Secretary)**

The Committee was reminded that as a result of Robert Gardiner's recent announcement that he would be stepping down at the end of the Michaelmas Term 2024, and as a result the election process for the next Secretary of the Bursars' Committee would need to be instigated.

It was now reported that the Business Committee had taken the opportunity to review and recommended to the Committee updates to the processes governing the role and its election. **The Committee received recommendations from the Business Committee and approved:**

- the formal re-designation of the role from "Secretary" to "Deputy Chair" (noting that, if approved, the Head of OIS would be appointed to a (different) role of Secretary *ex officio*).
- minor updates to the role (to account for differences since the previous review of it).
- amendments to the election process to cover where an election is needed exceptionally.

Consequently, the Committee also approved the revised job description, election process and terms of reference (as minute BC.23.83):

Paper 1	Job Description – Deputy Chair of the Bursars Committee
Paper 2	Bursars' Committee officers: Election process
Paper 3	Draft amendment to Bursars' Committee Terms of Reference

The Chair reported that the Appointments Committee to be convened for the search for the next Deputy Chair would be: Richard Anthony (JE), Robert Gardiner (CAI), Tamsin James (CHU), Michael Parsons (CHR) and Martin Pierce (SID). He thanked the other Bursars that had volunteered to serve.

BC.23.80 USS Pension liability

The Committee received a paper highlighting specific contingent pension liabilities which in the past the Committee has confirmed as affecting all Colleges:

Paper 4	USS Pension liability
---------	-----------------------

The Chair drew attention to the history of the issue outlined in the paper, noting specifically:

- the discussion of the Bursars' Committee on the matter, held on 23 June 2022, where the concept of the shared liability of all Colleges had been outlined and re-affirmed.
- the situation was now immediately applicable to CVC Ltd, but was also relevant to OIS Ltd.
- USS Ltd had agreed in principle to a flexible apportionment arrangement such that CVC Ltd's potential liability could be apportioned to a single employer (a request for a multi-employer apportionment has been rejected as being too complex).
- Homerton College is the guarantor College for CVC Ltd. (Clare College is the guarantor College for OIS Ltd.)

In addressing the options set out in paragraph 5 and the questions set out in paragraph 8, **the Committee agreed:**

- a) **its understanding and acceptance of the original shared indemnity of all Colleges in relation to CVC Ltd.**
- b) **to support the understanding of the Business Committee that the USS pension scheme was closed for CVC Ltd and support the recommendation that no attempt be made to disturb this position, noting this is technically a matter for the company board.** The Senior Bursar of Downing College who is the current Chair of the Board of CVC Ltd also supported this recommendation at the meeting in his capacity as Chair of the Board.
- c) **no further decision could be made about addressing the Section 75 debt until the size of it had been reported by USS Ltd., which was expected at some point over the Long Vacation.**

The Committee otherwise noted:

1. upon receipt of advice on the size of the debt, the Board of CVC Ltd. would discuss whether it would be appropriate for it to pay the Section 75 debt out of its reserves, consulting its College members as necessary.
2. should the Board decide the company was unable to pay the debt or that it was otherwise significantly in the interests of the continued operation of the company not to pay the debt, given the existence of the indemnity from Homerton College, the Chair of the Board would discuss the matter further with the Chair of the Bursars' Committee and the Bursar of Homerton College to discuss whether to ask Colleges to raise the funds to pay the debt or otherwise apply for a flexible apportionment arrangement (which would not itself be cost-neutral given the need for legal advice). Any recommendation arising from these discussions would be reported in the first instance to the Business Committee.
3. any decision made regarding the circumstances of CVC Ltd. should not set a precedent should the same circumstances arise for OIS Ltd. (owing to a number of factors including: the commercial nature of CVC being quite different to OIS, which is a provider of core services to all Colleges; the number of employees currently and historically in the USS pension scheme; the different Boards' current pensions policies; and that – unlike at CVC – all Colleges had a substantial interest in OIS and its range of support activities for the Colleges).

BC.23.81 Size and Shape

The Chair updated the Committee on the ongoing uncertain status of the currently-in-draft Memorandum of Understanding (with the University) on Full-Time Student Numbers. He noted that the University and Colleges Joint Committee had agreed to disband the Joint Working Group on Size and Shape, and that its business would be transferred formally to the General Board. He noted that there was residual business (including its views on a draft Memorandum of Understanding) and that a final meeting of the Joint Working Group was currently being scheduled.

It was reported that individual agreements between the University and the Accept All Colleges had been agreed in principle for 2024-25 (as reported at the last meeting) but that discussions about future agreements had not progressed.

The Committee noted that, for postgraduate student numbers, there were two distinct issues – one was the numbers of students that the Colleges and the University separately agreed to admit over time, and the other was specifically related to the prospect of a suitable volume of accommodation being available within Cambridge as a city (noting the various sources of accommodation: College-owned, University-owned and private market). On the latter point, it was noted that the University was currently undertaking research about postgraduate accommodation (and had received both

University and College data relating to this) and that there may be future legislation that might significantly reduce the attractiveness of student residents in the private sector market.

The Committee noted that it was not clear where in the University the matter of the availability of Cambridge-city student accommodation was being addressed at a strategic level, and it was suggested that this should be raised as a point of concern to the University's Planning and Resources Committee.

BC.23.82 University pay proposals

With thanks to Helen Foord, attention was drawn to a recently-published offer by UCEA to the unions, which can be viewed at:

<https://www.ucea.ac.uk/our-work/collective-pay-negotiations-landing/2024-25-new-jnches-pay-round/>

Attention was drawn to paragraph 2 (pay uplift) and, from discussions with the University's Chief Financial Officer, this has been interpreted as (by 1 March 2025) the pay settlement would be either £1,150 or 2.5% (whichever is the greater). It was stressed that this was currently an offer and not a confirmed position.

The Chair further noted that the University was considering its own response to this and, further to the matters outlined at the last meeting, it was likely that the University would consider some form of "supplement" to the national pay agreement. Any proposals would likely be considered by Council on 15 July 2024.

The Committee discussed the implications on the rates agreed at the last meeting on supervision intercollegiate re-charge rates. The current interpretation of the offer would mean that the rates would rise by 3.4% (and not the assumed 3% previously discussed). **The Committee agreed that adopting a two-stage uplift process, as proposed in the national agreement, would be confusing and that therefore any final uplift should be based on the final settlement position, but implemented from the beginning of the academic year.** Further clarity on the precise rates would be provided later in the Long Vacation as part of its annual exercise of updating workers' agreements and CamCORS.

The Committee further noted that it would be helpful for the University to consider carefully its communications about its pay deal for its own employees, highlighting that the clarity and quality of those communications could have a major impact on the Colleges.

OTHER MATTERS FOR DECISION

BC.23.83 Amendments to terms of reference

a) Bursars' Committee

The Committee approved a minor amendment to its terms of reference (to re-name the role of Secretary to Deputy Chair):

Paper 3 Draft terms of reference: Bursars' Committee

Further to the above, the Committee also authorised OIS to amend all other documents and terms of references to recognise the re-designation of the role of "Secretary" to "Deputy Chair".

BC.23.84 Membership of Sub-Committees and Other Bodies

The Committee approved the following proposals for representation on other committees:

<i>on...</i>	<i>appointment of...</i>	<i>replacing...</i>
General Purchasing Sub-Committee (Chair*)	Steven Morris (M)	Lizzy Conder (CL)

*and ex officio Director of Office of Intercollegiate Services Ltd

STANDING BUSINESS – MATTERS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES FOR INFORMATION OR REPORT**BC.23.85 Bursars' Business Committee**

The minutes of the Bursars' Business Committee were received for information:

Paper 5 Minutes of the meeting on 20 June 2024

Matters arising from those minutes that require discussion have been raised elsewhere in the agenda.

BC.23.86 Undergraduate Admissions Committee and Cambridge Admissions Management Group

The Committee received for information the minutes of the Undergraduate Admissions Committee, together with an update on current progress towards providing new assessments for candidates applying in 2024:

Paper 6 Minutes of Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 17 June 2024

Paper 7 Update on Undergraduate Admissions Testing 2024-25, June 2024

Rod Cantrill (F) drew attention to the two current issues being considered by UAT-UK in relation to the tests delivered through Pearson: the current inability of Pearson to deliver the required three banks of questions for TMUA, and the tax position of test fees in Japan.

BC.23.87 Student Support committees

The Committee received for information the minutes of a recent meeting of the Joint Wellbeing Committee:

Paper 8 Minutes of the Joint Wellbeing Committee, 13 June 2024

BC.23.88 Minutes and Reports from Sub-Committees and Other Intercollegiate Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Meetings since last BC</i>
<i>Bursar Sub-Committees</i>	
General Purchasing Sub-Committee	13 June 2024
Legal Affairs and Employment Sub-Committee	14 June 2024
<i>Other Intercollegiate Committees</i>	
ICCA	25 June 2024 Appendix 1: RCCA Proforma 2024 Appendix 2: Guidance for RCCA proforma update
Colleges' Standing Committee	11 June 2024
University and Colleges Joint Committee	18 June 2024

Reports had been received from the following:

Sub-Committee	Chair	Written report for this BC
Legal Affairs & Employment Sub-Committee	Jo Cheffins (W)	9

a) Minutes and Reports from Committee Representatives on University Committees and Joint Committees

Minutes had been received from the following committees:

	<i>Minutes received since last BC</i>
Admissions Assessments Steering Group	4 June 2024
Access and Participation Plan Scrutiny Group	10 June 2024
Cambridge Outreach Strategy Group	13 June 2024
College Wellbeing Stimulus Fund	7 June 2024
Equality, Diversity & Inclusion Committee	5 February 2024
Human Resources Committee	2 May 2024
Postgraduate Admissions Committee	7 March 2024

FINAL DISCUSSIONS**BC.23.89 Report of Teaching Review at Colleges' Committee on 6 July 2024**

The Chair noted that Colleges' Committee would be receiving an update report on the Teaching Review at its meeting on 6 July 2024 (which would also be received at the Senior Tutors' Committee on 19 July 2024). He reported that he would raise concerns that the papers being presented had a low emphasis on key matters proposed by the Bursars, including the need to address staff (as well as student) workload and necessary revisions to the supervision systems and supervision norms. It was noted that these points were in the current plans of the Review, with questions being asked of Faculties and Departments, but that the current reports may not necessarily reflect this clearly. The concerns would also be highlighted at the Senior Tutors' Committee.

BC.23.90 Future meetings

Remaining Meeting dates (dark blue) for 2023-24 are listed below, together with informal Network discussions (light blue):

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
EASTER TERM			
11 Jul 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	

BC.23.91 Future meetings 2024-25

Meeting dates for the 2024-25 were confirmed as set out below:

Date	Approximate times	Bursars Network Meeting	Bursars' Committee
MICHAELMAS TERM			
10 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
24 Oct 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
7 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
14 Nov 2024	2:00-4:00		Meeting Pembroke
21 Nov 2024	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
LENT TERM			
23 Jan 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
6 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
20 Feb 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
27 Feb 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting Peterhouse
6 Mar 2025	2:00-3:30	Network Zoom	
EASTER TERM			
24 April 2025 [Reserve for Levies business]	2:00-4:00		Meeting Queens'
1 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
15 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
29 May 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
5 Jun 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting Robinson
12 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
26 Jun 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	
3 Jul 2025	2:00-4:00		Meeting St Edmund's
10 Jul 2025	2:00-3:00	Network Zoom	

BC.23.92 Farewells and committee membership

The Committee noted that this was the last meeting of the following members, and thanked them for their contributions to the work of the Committee:

- Marina Frasca Spada, Chair of the Senior Tutors' Committee
- Rowan Kitt, Development Director, Queens' College

It noted that they would be succeeded respectively by Judith Bunbury (W) and Francesca Malaree (CHU) next year.

BC.23.93 Record of thanks

On behalf of the Committee, the Chair thanked the Principal and Fellows of Newnham College for their generous hospitality.

BC.23.94 Items of reserved business

There were no items of reserved business.

2024-07-04 BC minutes

Matthew Russell
5 July 2024